Removal and Recovery of Phosphorus from Wastewaters Using Mine Drainage Ochres

Phillip L. Sibrell and Stephen P. Faulkner
USGS Leetown Science Center,
Kearneysville, WV  25430

Greater Everglades Ecosystem Restoration
April 23, 2019

U.S. Department of the Interior
U.S. Geological Survey
Excess P in the Chesapeake Bay Watershed

Watersheds with the highest nutrient per-acre loads have...

A long history of excess nutrient inputs, which can result in:

**Phosphorus saturated soils.**
Phosphorus can be stored in soils when applications exceed crop removal rates. In areas where this has occurred, up to half of the total phosphorus load is exported in dissolved form\(^4\).

Average phosphorus balance\(^{3,4}\) in 2012, in pounds per acre

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Balance (lb/ac)</th>
<th>Color</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Dark</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Light</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Light</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-5</td>
<td>Medium</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Average nutrient load\(^1\) between 2007 and 2016, in lb/ac

- **Low**
- **Medium**
- **High**

From Moyer et al. 2018

Anoxic Dead Zones in Chesapeake Bay
Acid Mine Drainage (AMD)

Coal/Pyrite + Air + Water $\rightarrow$ AMD

Over 5,000 stream miles impacted by AMD in the Appalachian region (EPA 1995)
Treating AMD
You Always Get Iron Oxides (Ochres)
Why are we talking about AMD Ochres?
P Sorption Thermodynamics

```
Solids [P], mg/kg

Solution [P], mg/L

- Friend. Hill
- Toby Creek
- Blue Valley
- Brandy Camp
- Marchand A
- Rousch Creek
- LCN
- Fly Ash

USGS
```
The Rate of P Removal from Water is Important, too.
Strip solution (0.5 M NaOH) removed 76% of P, and concentrated it up to 1000-fold.
P Removal Technologies

- Addition of Fe or Al salts
  - Requires purchase of reagent, i.e. alum, FeCl₃, or similar
  - Requires solid/liquid separation after dosing, sludge disposal

- Biological P uptake/wetlands
  - More complex treatment configuration
  - Difficult to retrofit to existing plants
  - Extensive land area
Fixed-bed P removal
- Use ochre (waste product) for sorption media
- No solid/liquid separation
- Recovery and recycle of P
- Regenerate media
- Ability to add to existing system
# What About Water Contamination?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sludge Source</th>
<th>Al (mg/L)</th>
<th>Ca (mg/L)</th>
<th>Fe (mg/L)</th>
<th>K (mg/L)</th>
<th>Mg (mg/L)</th>
<th>Mn (mg/L)</th>
<th>Na (mg/L)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Friendship Hill</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>51.1</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toby Creek</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
<td>0.74</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brandy Camp</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
<td>4.06</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glen White</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.07</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ace ALD</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Babb Creek</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>0.6</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
<td>&lt;5</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDL</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sludge Source</th>
<th>As (mg/L)</th>
<th>Cd (mg/L)</th>
<th>Co (mg/L)</th>
<th>Cu (mg/L)</th>
<th>Ni (mg/L)</th>
<th>Pb (mg/L)</th>
<th>Zn (mg/L)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Friendship Hill</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>0.002</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toby Creek</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.02</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brandy Camp</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glen White</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ace ALD</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.02</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Babb Creek</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>&lt;0.02</td>
<td>&lt;0.01</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>&lt;0.05</td>
<td>0.16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDL</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results:
- 223 days operation total
- Average flow of 1 gal/min (1440 gal/day)
- 320,000 gal treated (88,000 bed volumes)
- 56% overall P removal (91 g P)
Scale-up: 100,000 gallons per day
USDA-ARS Broodstock Facility, Kearneysville, WV

- 20,000 fish (4000 kg)
- 150 gpm makeup water
Results:

- 174 days operation w/o regeneration
- Average flow of 53 gal/min (75,000 gal/day)
- 13.2 MM gal treated (26,800 bed volumes)
- 73% overall P removal (7.2 lb P)
George Barley Water Prize – Stage 3 Canada Pilot

Results:

- 91 days operation w/o regeneration
- Flow range: ~9,500-32,000 L/d
- Mean TP influent 354 ug/L
- 87% overall P removal
Summary

- Mine drainage ochres are a low-cost source of iron/aluminum oxides that have a high affinity for P.
- Fixed bed sorption trials indicate that effective P removal is possible over days to months of operation.
- Phosphorus can be stripped from the media, precipitated, and recycled to agricultural applications.
- The sorption media can be regenerated and reused for many cycles of sorption and regeneration, thus leading to decreased operating costs.
- Applicable to various wastewater sources.
Thank you!

faulkners@usgs.gov